

Sakurai 1-17

Given:  $[A_1, A_2] \neq 0$ , and  $A_1, A_2$  are observables.

$H$  is the Hamiltonian, and  $[A_1, H] = 0$ ,  $[A_2, H] = 0$

We are asked to prove that the energy eigenstates of  $A_1$  and  $A_2$  exhibit some degeneracy. In other words Prove that  $[A_1, A_2] \neq 0$  implies there is some degeneracy.

Proof by Contrapositive. Assume there is no degeneracy. Prove  $[A_1, A_2] = 0$  we know  $HA_1 = A_1H$  and  $HA_2 = A_2H$ .

Thus  $HA_1|E\rangle = E(A_1|E\rangle)$  and  $HA_2|E\rangle = E(A_2|E\rangle)$  where  $|E\rangle$  is an energy eigenstate of  $H$  w/ eigenvalue  $E$ .

Thus, since  $H$  and  $A_1$  (and  $H$  and  $A_2$ ) commute, they share a complete set of eigenstates. In other words  $|E\rangle$  is an eigenstate of both  $A_1$  and  $A_2$ . We should really write

$|E, a_1, a_2\rangle$  so  $A_1|E, a_1, a_2\rangle = a_1|E, a_1, a_2\rangle$  and  $A_2|E, a_1, a_2\rangle = a_2|E, a_1, a_2\rangle$  Usually, you only put "good" quantum numbers in the kets

But for simplicity, I'll just use  $|E\rangle$ .   
 Now notice:   
  $(A_1A_2 - A_2A_1)|E\rangle = (A_1A_2 - A_2A_1)|E\rangle = [A_1, A_2]|E\rangle$    
 Thus  $[A_1, A_2] = 0$ . Thus degeneracy must exist.   
 unless you're assuming no degeneracy   
 Since  $A_1$  and  $A_2$  do not commute, you cannot have's multiple eigenstates (and you only write either  $a_1$  or  $a_2$  in the ket.)

An "exception" (or a case in which there is no degeneracy) is

$L^2$  operating on  $|l=0, m=0\rangle$

$$L^2|l=0, m=0\rangle = \frac{\hbar^2}{2} l(l+1)|l=0, m=0\rangle = 0|l=0, m=0\rangle.$$

The eigenvalue of  $L^2$  w/ respect to eigenstate  $|l=0, m=0\rangle$  is 0.

There are NO OTHER states that, when acted upon

by operator  $L^2$  return 0.

( $l > 0 \Rightarrow l(l+1) > 0$  as well.   
  $m \neq 0 \Rightarrow l \neq 0$ .)

More generally, if  $A_1|E\rangle = 0$  or  $A_2|E\rangle = 0$ , the proof falls apart.